

HERITAGE ASSESSMENT

ASFORDBY PARISH NEIGHBOURHOOD PLAN



FOR: ASFORDBY PARISH COUNCIL

Trigpoint Conservation & Planning Ltd

September 2016



RTPI

mediation of space · making of place

trigpoint conservation & planning ltd

6 Guildford Way, Loughborough, Leics LE11 3SE

t: 01509 828288

m: 07941 809921

www.trigpointcp.co.uk

e-mail: sb@trigpointcp.co.uk

Document Control Sheet

| | |
|----------------------|---|
| PROJECT NAME: | Asfordby Parish Neighbourhood Plan_Heritage Assessment |
| CLIENT: | Asfordby Parish Council |
| PROJECT REFERENCE | 16047 |
| PROJECT LEAD | S Bradwell, MA MRTPI IHBC |
| TEAM MEMBERS | S Bradwell, MA MRTPI IHBC Dr R Usher BA(Hons) MSc PgDip |

| Version | File Ref | Description | Prepared | Checked | Date |
|-------------|----------|-------------------------------|----------|---------|--------------|
| FINAL (PDF) | 16047 | Report of Heritage Assessment | SB | SB | 25 Sept 2016 |
| | | | | | |

Produced by:

Trigpoint Conservation & Planning Ltd
6 Guildford Way, Loughborough
Leicestershire LE11 3SE

Contact:
Stephen Bradwell
email: sb@trigpointcp.co.uk
t: 01509 828288

1.0 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 1.1 This heritage assessment has been prepared on behalf of Asfordby Parish Council by Trigpoint Conservation & Planning Ltd. to assess the potential impact of the policies and proposals in the Asfordby Parish Neighbourhood Plan (APNP) on the various heritage assets within Asfordby Parish.
- 1.2 The assessment has considered that the generic policies in the APNP are largely neutral in terms of the historic environment, but there are concerns that Policy A8, in respect of the local heritage assets, is not consistent with the guidance in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and may therefore not be afforded any weight in the decision-taking process.
- 1.3 The assessment has also considered the impact of development on the allocated residential and employment sites within the APNP on the setting of the heritage assets within Asfordby Parish. It is generally concluded that the development of the sites proposed within the APNP will not have any adverse impact on the setting or significance of any listed buildings in the Asfordby Parish and will not harm the character or appearance of the Asfordby Conservation Area. In this context it is considered that the allocation of the residential and employment sites within the APNP is consistent with the objectives of the NPPF in respect of development within the historic environment.

2.0 BACKGROUND INFORMATION

- 2.1 The Asfordby Parish area consists of three distinct settlements: Asfordby, Asfordby Valley and Asfordby Hill, that are situated on the rising land to the north of the River Wreake, and APNP is being prepared as a basis for determining most planning applications in the Parish in the context of the emerging Melton Local Plan.
- 2.2 To promote sustainable development within the Parish the APNP seeks to inform the decision-taking process within the Parish, and as the NPPF makes clear, the protection and enhancement of the built and historic environment is one of three principal dimensions of sustainable development [para. 7].
- 2.3 The assessment identified a single conservation area within the Parish within the settlement of Asfordby and 18 listed buildings within the Parish. These are grouped within two distinct clusters, one within the historic core of Asfordby Village, principally along Main Street, and a second cluster located at Welby Grange, along with the remnants of its former deserted Medieval settlement (DMV), which can be considered as

a non-designated heritage asset given its archaeological and historic interest.

3.0 IDENTIFICATION OF HERITAGE ASSETS WITHIN ASFORDBY PARISH

3.1 The following sources of information have been used to identify the designated heritage assets within the locality:

- relevant designation records from Historic England's *Heritage List for England*;
- information on the Asfordby Village Conservation Area was obtained from Melton Borough Council's web site;
- the Leicestershire Historic Environment Record (HER) was accessed via the Heritage Gateway.

3.2 A site visit was undertaken on 4 August 2016 to survey the proposed development sites and their relationship with any designated and non-designated heritage assets within the vicinity of the respective development sites.

4.0 SUMMARY OF THE HERITAGE ASSETS WITHIN ASFORDBY PARISH

Listed Buildings

4.1 The 18 listed buildings within the Parish, include the following:

- *Grade I*
 - Church of All Saints, Church Lane
- *Grade II**
 - Church of St Bartholomew, Welby Lane
 - The Old Hall, Main Street
- *Grade II*
 - Nos. 90 And 92, Main Street
 - The Elms at Asfordby Service Station, Main Street
 - Village Cross, Main Street
 - Coach House And Stable at The Old Hall, Main Street
 - Barn at the Old Hall, Main Street
 - Pump approximately 30 metres south west of the Old Hall, Main Street
 - The Blue Bell Public House, Main Street
 - No. 159, Main Street
 - Beechcroft, no. 15, Church Lane
 - Chest Tomb Approximately 2 metres south west of porch of All Saints Church, Church Lane
 - Garden boundary wall with gate piers to north west of Beechcroft (no. 15), Church Lane,

- Welby Grange, Welby
- Grange Cottage, Welby Lane
- Stone outbuilding immediately east of Welby Grange
- Red Lodge, Hoby Road

Conservation Areas: Asfordby Village

- 4.2 The historic core of Asfordby Village, which includes the main group of listed buildings within the village, has been designated as a Conservation Area. The Asfordby Village Conservation Area Appraisal (CAA) identifies that the Conservation Area boundary is tightly drawn around the historic core of the village that includes the area around All Saints Church and the washlands alongside the River Wreake surrounding the old Mill.
- 4.3 The CAA also outlines the elements that contribute to and define the Conservation Area's character and appearance and recognises that the village as a whole demonstrates a wide variety of building styles and materials.

Scheduled Monuments

- 4.4 There are no scheduled monuments within Asfordby Parish.
- 4.5 There are four scheduled monument designations located in close proximity to the Asfordby Parish Boundary:
- Kirby Bellars Priory, a former moated priory site about 600m to the south-east of Asfordby village;
 - Garden, moat and five fishponds at Kirby Bellars about 1,400m to the south-east of Asfordby village;
 - Village cross at the western end of Main Street at Frisby-on-the Wreake about 1,350m to the south-west of Asfordby village;
 - Sysonby Grange, includes the earthwork and buried remains of a monastic grange about 3,500m to the north-east of Asfordby village.
- 4.6 None of these scheduled monuments are considered to be sensitive to development on any of the proposed development sites due to their relative distance from the respective sites, and by screening from intervening built development and mature tree cover. Therefore these scheduled monuments are given no further consideration within this report.

Registered Parks and Gardens of Special Historic Interest

- 4.7 There are no Registered Parks and Gardens of Special Historic Interest within Asfordby Parish.

Non-Designated Heritage Assets

- 4.8 The deserted Medieval village at Welby, on the north-eastern side of the Parish, is identified by the HER (HER ref. MLE3340) and it is therefore considered to be a non-designated heritage asset having regard to its archaeological and historic interest that merits consideration in the assessment of any development proposals. The HER describes the site as follows:

Deserted medieval village. It had two parallel hollow ways, one still largely followed by the modern lane. Numerous earthworks including building platforms were visible but are now built over. Saxo-Norman and medieval pottery was found whilst digging trial pits in 1982.

5.0 SUMMARY OF THE PLANNING POLICY CONTEXT IN RELATION TO THE HISTORIC ENVIRONMENT

- 5.1 The assessment of the general policies and the potential impact of the proposed development sites on any designated and non-designated heritage assets within the vicinity of the respective development sites in the APNP has had regard to the following policy context:

Statutory Designations

Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act, 1979

- 5.2 Whilst this Act affords statutory protection to scheduled monuments, the impact of development on the setting of a scheduled monument is beyond the scope of the Act and is governed by national and local planning policies.

Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act, 1990

- 5.3 This Act requires Councils to have special regard to the desirability of preserving a listed building and/or its setting (section 66) and to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of conservation areas (section 72).

Development Plan

Melton Borough Local Plan, 1999.

- 5.4 The current Development Plan for Melton Borough comprises the saved policies of the Melton Borough Local Plan. There are however no saved policies in the Local Plan

relating to development in conservation areas or affecting the setting of listed buildings.

- 5.5 There are two saved Local Plan policies relating to the historic environment, these include, Policy BE9: *Historic Parks and Gardens*, which is not relevant in Asfordby Parish as there are no registered Parks and Gardens, and Policy BE11: *Archaeological Sites of County or District Significance*, which would be a material consideration in assessing any development proposals affecting the Welby DMV.

- 5.6 Policy BE11 states that:
Planning permission will only be granted for development which would have a detrimental effect on archaeological remains of County or District significance if the importance of the development outweighs the local value of the remains. If planning permission is given for development which would affect remains of County or District significance, conditions will be imposed to ensure that the remains are properly recorded and evaluated and, where practicable, preserved.

Emerging Melton Local Plan 2014

- 5.7 A new Melton Local Plan is presently being prepared and the most relevant policy in the Emerging Options (Draft Plan) January 2016 relating to the historic environment is Policy EN13: *Heritage Assets*.

- 5.8 Policy EN13 states that:
The Council will take a positive approach to the conservation of heritage assets and the wider historic environment through:
A) seeking to ensure the protection and enhancement of heritage assets and their settings when considering proposals for development on, in, or adjacent to them. Proposed development should avoid harm to the significance of historic sites, buildings or areas, including their setting.
B) seeking new developments to make a positive contribution to the character and distinctiveness of the local area.
C) ensuring that new developments in conservation areas are consistent with the identified special character of those areas and seeking to identify new conservation areas, where appropriate
D) seeking to secure the viable and sustainable future of heritage assets through uses that are consistent with the heritage asset and its conservation; and
E) allowing sustainable tourism opportunities in heritage assets in the Borough where the uses are appropriate and would not undermine the integrity or significance of the heritage

asset.

National Planning Policy Framework

- 5.9 The NPPF states that the purpose of the planning system is to contribute to the achievement of sustainable development [para. 6] where the protection and enhancement of the built and historic environment is one of three principal dimensions of sustainable development [para. 7]. The NPPF also identifies a number of key land-use planning principles, including support for the conservation of heritage assets in a manner appropriate to their significance [paras. 17 & 126].
- 5.10 The NPPF defines heritage assets as: *'a building, monument, site, place, area or landscape positively identified as having a degree of significance meriting consideration in planning decisions, because of its heritage interest'* [Annex 2] and this includes both designated heritage assets (such as scheduled monuments, listed buildings, registered parks and gardens and conservation areas) and other non-designated assets identified by the local planning authority.
- 5.11 Annex 2 of the NPPF further notes that significance relates to the archaeological, architectural, artistic or historic interest of a heritage asset, that *'derives not only from a heritage asset's physical presence, but also from its setting'*, where setting is defined as *'the surroundings in which a heritage asset is experienced'*, recognising that *'elements of a setting may make a positive or negative contribution to the significance of an asset'*.
- 5.12 The NPPF recognises that the significance of a designated heritage asset can be harmed or lost through development within its setting [para. 132] and it therefore advises that substantial harm to the significance of a Grade II listed building should be exceptional, whereas substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset of the highest significance (such as scheduled monuments and Grade I & II* listed buildings) should be wholly exceptional. Although the accompanying National Planning Policy Guidance makes clear that the test for 'substantial harm' is a high one that is not expected to occur in many cases.
- 5.13 The NPPF further advises that in cases where it is considered that a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal [paras. 134 & 138].

5.14 The NPPF also accepts that not all elements of a conservation area will necessarily contribute to its significance [para. 138] and it encourages local planning authorities to look for development opportunities in conservation areas [para. 137]. However it advises that the loss of a building or other element which makes a positive contribution to the significance of a conservation area should be treated either as substantial harm or less than substantial harm, as appropriate, taking into account the relative significance of the element affected and its contribution to the significance of the conservation area [para. 138].

5.15 The NPPF also notes that the effect of an application on the significance of a non-designated heritage asset should be taken into account in determining the application, and requiring that a balanced judgment be made having regard to the scale of any harm or loss and the significance of the heritage asset [para. 135]. Further noting that non-designated heritage assets of archaeological interest that are demonstrably of equivalent significance to scheduled monuments should be considered subject to the policies for designated heritage assets [para. 139].

6.0 ASSESSMENT OF APNP PLANNING POLICIES

6.1 Outside of the proposed housing and employment allocations most of the policies in the APNP have no implications for the historic environment, the two exceptions are Policy A3: Wind Turbines and Policy A8: Local Heritage Assets.

Policy A3: Wind Turbines

6.2 Policy A3 requires that proposals for wind turbines within the Parish have regard to a number of criteria, including 'heritage assets and their setting'.

6.3 This particular requirement is considered to be consistent with section 66 of the *Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act, which requires that* special regard is given to the desirability of preserving a listed building and/or its setting, and to the guidance in the NPPF, which recognises that the significance of a designated heritage asset can be harmed or lost through development within its setting [para. 132].

Recommendation

6.4 No change to Policy A3: *Wind Turbines*.

Policy A8: Local Heritage Assets

6.5 Policy A8 is the only policy in the APNP dealing directly with heritage assets. This policy

identifies thirteen buildings and structures that are considered to be of local importance and it requires these local heritage assets to '*be conserved and enhanced*'.

- 6.6 The wording of this policy is however considered to be ambiguous, in that the objective to conserve suggests these assets will be protected from loss or harm, while enhanced suggests some degree of positive change. Both of these objectives cannot be secured at the same time.
- 6.7 The policy also lacks some degree of clarity as there is no indication as to how the objectives of '*conserved and enhanced*' will be achieved.
- 6.8 Furthermore to hold any weight in the planning process this policy must also be consistent with the NPPF. In this regard whilst the NPPF recognises that heritage assets can include buildings identified at a local level, it does not specifically require such buildings to be '*conserved and enhanced*'. Paragraph 135 of the NPPF makes clear that '*the effect of an application on the significance of a non-heritage asset should be taken into account in the determination of the application*', and that '*a balanced judgement will be required having regard to the scale of any harm or loss and the significance of the heritage asset*'.
- 6.9 There is also an inherent weakness in the policy as it does not provide any evidence of the selection criteria that was used to identify these local heritage assets and their significance. The advice prepared by Historic England makes clear that there should be a consistent and accountable way of identifying local heritage assets with a clearly defined set of criteria and process for the selection of these local heritage assets and that is also open to public comment (Historic England: *Local Heritage Listing Historic England Advice Note 7*).

Recommendation

- 6.10 That the wording of Policy A8: *Local Heritage Assets* and the selection of the local heritage assets should be reviewed to ensure that it is consistent with the NPPF and follows good practice guidance established by Historic England.
- 6.11 At the very minimum some regard should be given to rewording the first line of the policy to:
'The determination of planning applications will have regard to the preservation or enhancement of...' the identified local heritage assets.

- 6.12 Furthermore the selection criteria used to identify these buildings should be made public and this should identify the architectural and historic interest of these local heritage assets and their significance.

7.0 ASSESSMENT OF PROPOSED RESIDENTIAL ALLOCATIONS

Policy A12: Land between Regency Road, Asfordby and the Bypass

Site Context

- 7.1 This proposed housing allocation consists of a series of linear paddocks located on the northern edge of Asfordby, between the existing housing development fronting Regency Road and the A6006, Asfordby bypass.

Designated Heritage Assets

- 7.2 None of the listed buildings within Asfordby lie within the vicinity of the allocated site and views towards the village centre, and All Saints church spire on the south side of Main Street in particular, are blocked by the existing development on Regency Road.
- 7.3 The allocated site also lies some 250 metres north of the designated Asfordby Conservation Area and is separated from it by the existing residential development on the north side of Asfordby village.

Potential Impact on Local Designated Heritage Assets

- 7.4 As a result of the relative distance between this site and the designated heritage assets within Asfordby and the intervening built development, this site does not contribute to the setting of any of the listed buildings in the village and its development will not harm the significance of these listed buildings or the character or appearance of the Asfordby Conservation Area.

Recommendation

- 7.5 No changes required to Policy A12.

Policy A13: Whitlock Garages, Asfordby

Site Context

- 7.6 This proposed housing allocation consists of an existing garage court that runs between Charnwood Avenue and Whitlock Way, and it includes a small area of open space to the rear of the properties fronting Charnwood Avenue. The site itself is surrounded on all four sides by existing residential development.

Designated Heritage Assets

- 7.7 None of the listed buildings within Asfordby lie within the vicinity of the allocated site, however there are views of All Saints church spire, which is a distinctive landmark within Asfordby, on the south side of Main Street above the roofs of the intervening residential development.
- 7.8 The allocated site also lies some 100 metres north of the designated Asfordby Conservation Area and is separated from it by the existing residential development on the north side of Asfordby village.

Potential Impact on Local Designated Heritage Assets

- 7.9 As a result of the relative distance between this site and the designated heritage assets within Asfordby and the intervening built development, this site does not contribute to the setting of any of the listed buildings in the village, other than the church, and its development will not harm the significance of these listed buildings or the character or appearance of the Asfordby Conservation Area.
- 7.10 The wider views of the church spire from within the village contribute to its overall significance, and whilst there are views of the church spire from this site, it makes only a minor contribution to the setting of All Saints church and its overall significance given the relative distance between the allocation site and the church and the intervening development. The development of the site for housing will therefore have a negligible impact on the setting of the church and its overall significance.
- 7.11 However to mitigate the potential impact of the development of this site for housing on these existing views of the church spire, the layout of any future development should endeavour to preserve views through the site to the church spire.

Recommendation

- 7.12 To fully comply with local and national and planning policies that seek to protect the setting of listed buildings, it is recommended that an additional criteria be added to Policy A13 to advise that the layout of the future development maintains views through the site to All Saints church spire.

Policy A14: Asfordby Storage and Haulage Depot, Main Street, Asfordby

Site Context

- 7.13 This proposed housing allocation consists of a range of commercial buildings on a large

site at the eastern end of Main Street. The site has a long and prominent frontage to Main Street, with a substantial vehicular access, and it extends between existing residential developments from Main Street to the River Wreake on the south side of the village.

- 7.14 The buildings within the site are essentially utilitarian industrial sheds of poor architectural quality and given their incremental development over time have no uniformity in terms of their scale, design, materials or appearance.

Designated Heritage Assets

- 7.15 The Grade II listed nos. 90 & 92 Main Street, a 17th - 18th century timber framed and red brick house, lies on the north side of Main Street opposite the allocated site. The remaining listed buildings within Asfordby lie some distance to the west of the site, but there are also views of All Saints church spire over the site from Main Street to the east of the site.

- 7.16 Although the site itself lies outside of the designated Asfordby Conservation Area, it does lie at the entrance to the Conservation Area and the western boundary of the allocated site is contiguous with the Conservation Area boundary.

Potential Impact on Local Designated Heritage Assets

- 7.17 As a result of the relative distance of this site from the listed buildings towards the western end of Main Street and the intervening built development, the development of this site will not harm the setting of any of these listed buildings.
- 7.18 However any future development of the site will need to have regard to its potential impact on the setting of nos. 90 & 92 Main Street. The CABE design brief, included as Appendix 2 to the Neighbourhood Plan, proposes that the stand of trees in the north-western corner of this site opposite these Grade II listed properties should be retained and if this was provided for in the future development of the site, the overall setting of nos. 90 & 92 Main Street would be preserved.
- 7.19 However if this north-western corner of this site was to be redeveloped for new housing, careful consideration will be required in the layout, design and appearance of any new development to ensure that this development does not harm the setting of these listed properties.
- 7.20 The wider views of All Saints church spire from within the village contribute to the

overall significance of the church. Whilst the development of this site for housing will not have any direct impact on the setting of the church or its overall significance given the relative distance between the allocation site and the church and the intervening housing development, there is an opportunity to better reveal the existing views of the church spire from Main Street to the east of the site by providing a viewing corridor through the site towards the church spire.

- 7.21 The CABE design brief draws attention to the views across the site to All Saints Church, but does not appear to fully address the views of its church spire from Main Street to the east of the site. To achieve this extended viewing corridor will however require some modification of the design brief, to require a viewing corridor through Zones 2 & 3 identified in the design brief as well as Zone 4.
- 7.22 The existing site also occupies a prominent position at the entrance to the Asfordby Conservation Area, and given its present appearance it seriously detracts from the character and appearance of the Area as well as its setting.
- 7.23 To ensure that the character and appearance of the Area, as well as its setting, is preserved or enhanced by any development on this site, the stand of trees in the north-western corner of this site, identified in the CABE design brief, should be retained as they mark the entrance to the Conservation Area and make a positive contribution to its overall setting as well as its character and appearance. In addition any development on the site frontage (within Zone 1 as identified in the design brief) should be of a high quality design and appearance given its prominent location at the entrance to the Conservation Area.

Recommendation

- 7.24 To fully comply with local and national and planning policies that seek to protect the setting of listed buildings, it is recommended that an additional criteria be added to Policy A14 to advise that the layout of the future development provides a viewing corridor through the site from Main Street to the east of the site towards All Saints church spire.

Policy A15: Land off Compton Road/Melton Road, Asfordby Hill

Site Context

- 7.25 This proposed housing allocation consists of a parcel of largely vacant and overgrown land to the rear of the existing properties off Crompton Road in Asfordby Hill.

Designated Heritage Assets

- 7.26 There are no listed buildings or conservation areas within the vicinity of this site.

Potential Impact on Local Designated Heritage Assets

- 7.27 As a result of the relative distance of this site from any of designated heritage assets within Asfordby Parish, the development of this site will not harm the setting of any listed buildings in Asfordby Parish and will not harm the character or appearance of the designated Asfordby Conservation Area.

Recommendation

- 7.28 No changes required to Policy A15.

Policy A 16: Land to the west of Station Lane, Asfordby

Site Context

- 7.29 This proposed housing allocation consists of open arable land on the west side of Asfordby village to the rear of the existing properties on Klondyke Way. An outline application for up to 100 dwellings was granted planning permission on 3 May 2016 following the completion of a section 106 agreement (application ref. 14/00980/OUT) and more recently a Reserved Matters application has been submitted for 100 residential units (application ref.16/00373/REM).

Recommendation

- 7.30 No assessment has been made of this site in view of this planning history.

8.0 ASSESSMENT OF PROPOSED EMPLOYMENT ALLOCATIONS

POLICY A25: Asfordby Business Park and Old Dalby Test Track

Site Context

- 8.1 The Asfordby Business Park site, which is the site of the former Asfordby mine, is located in a shallow valley to the north of Asfordby Hill and to the west of the Holwell Works. Given its relatively remote location, it lies outside of the principal settlements, the site is not particularly prominent and it is surrounded by open countryside and generally bounded by two roads, Welby Road (from Asfordby Hill) and Welby Lane (from Asfordby Valley).

Designated Heritage Assets

- 8.2 None of the listed buildings within Asfordby or the designated Asfordby Conservation Area lie within the vicinity of the allocated site, and the cluster of listed buildings at

Welby Grange, that lie to the northeast of this site, are suitably screened by the local topography.

- 8.3 However on the north side of Welby Lane, to the north-west of the Business Park, is the Grade II* listed St Bartholomew's Church, a small rural church of Medieval origin, dating primarily from the 14th & 15th centuries.
- 8.4 The church lies in an elevated location within open countryside and it has a close visual and historical relationship with its surrounding rural landscape. In particular the land immediately surrounding the church, on the north and south side of Welby Lane, is identified by the HER as the site of the Welby DMV. The DMV is clearly an important non-designated heritage asset that makes an important contribution to the open and rural setting of the Grade II* listed church and its overall significance.
- 8.5 The close relationship between the DMV and the church is evident in views both from and towards the church. There are far-reaching views from the church across this open landscape to the north of Welby Lane and over the remnants of the DMV to the south. Equally the church is a prominent feature in wider views, such as from the footpath to the north of the church and in breaks in the hedgerows along Welby Lane to the east, such as from the Gate C entrance to the Holwell Works where the open and rural setting of the church can be seen within the background of the Holwell Works and the Asfordby Business Park. This view from the east also illustrates the importance of the DMV on the south side of Welby Lane, providing an open setting to the south of the church and a buffer between the church and the Asfordby Business Park.
- 8.6 Whilst the close proximity of the neighbouring industrial sites have already compromised the setting of the church to an extent, given the nature of the local topography and relative distance between the sites, the existing industrial development does not impinge too much on the church and its surrounding landscape and the church still enjoys a substantially un-spoilt open aspect to the north, east and west and immediately to the south.

Potential Impact on Local Designated Heritage Assets

- 8.7 The allocation of the existing Business Park for future employment purposes within its present boundaries is likely to have a neutral impact on the setting of St Bartholomew's Church. However consideration will need to be given to the scale, design and layout of any new development at the northern end of the site, to minimise any potential intrusion

into the setting of the Grade II* listed church and potentially harming its overall significance.

- 8.8 Any extension to this employment allocation, particularly to the north-west of the existing site over the DMV, should however be resisted as this is likely to result in a substantial loss to the setting of the Grade II* church and harm to its overall significance.
- 8.9 In determining a recent planning appeal for the erection of a wind farm development consisting of nine turbines on land at the former Asfordby Mine site largely to the west of St Bartholomew's church(ref. APP/Y2430/A/13/2191290), the Inspector noted in paragraph 88 of the decision letter in respect of church that:
...the significance of this asset derives largely from its fabric, architecture and, to some extent, its relationship with the DMV. The most positive contribution that landscape setting makes to the asset's significance comes from fields to the north of the Lane and, to a lesser extent, the area where DMV earthworks remain on the south side of the Lane.
- 8.10 The rural landscape setting of the church makes a substantial contribution to its significance as a designated heritage asset, and given that this landscape has remained largely unchanged since the Medieval period, and the DMV site has a high degree of archaeological interest, this landscape is highly sensitive to change. Any expansion of the Business Park site to the west over the DMV land to the south of the church would potentially fill this land with large commercial buildings that would dominate the church, given the likely differences in scale, and be intrusive in views both from the church and the views towards over the DMV.
- 8.11 It is concluded that given the considerable degree of inter-visibility between any development on the DMV site and the church, and the potential for any new development to exert a strong visual dominance over the church, any extension of the business park will result in substantial harm to the setting of St Bartholomew's church resulting in a high degree of harm to its significance. In addition the loss of this section of the DMV would potentially result in substantial harm to the significance of this non-designated heritage asset and this degree of harm would need to be taken into account in the determination of any planning application, and depending on its archaeological interest any development on this part of the DMV should be considered against the policies for designated heritage assets.

Recommendation

- 8.12 To fully comply with local and national and planning policies that seek to protect the setting of listed buildings, it is recommended that the criteria attached to Policy A25 be amended to advise that the scale, design and layout of any new development at the northern end of the proposed development site should have regard to the impact on the setting of the Grade II* listed St Bartholomew's Church.

POLICY A26: Holwell Works

Site Context

- 8.13 The Holwell Works site, which was originally occupied by an iron foundry, is located in a shallow valley to the north of Asfordby Hill to the east of the Asfordby Business Park. Given its relatively remote location, it lies outside of the principal settlements, the site is not particularly prominent and it is surrounded by open countryside and generally bounded by two roads, Welby Road (from Asfordby Hill) and Welby Lane (from Asfordby Valley).

Designated Heritage Assets

- 8.14 None of the listed buildings within Asfordby or the designated Asfordby Conservation Area lie within the vicinity of the allocated site, and the cluster of listed buildings at Welby Grange, that lie to the north-east of the site, are suitably screened by the local topography.
- 8.15 However to the north-west of the Holwell Works, on the north side of Welby Lane, is the Grade II* listed St Bartholomew's Church, a small rural church of Medieval origin, dating from the 14th - 15th centuries.

Potential Impact on Local Designated Heritage Assets

- 8.16 Whilst the allocation of the existing Holwell Works for future employment purposes within its present boundaries is likely to have a neutral impact on the setting of St Bartholomew's Church, consideration will need to be given to the scale, design and layout of any new development at the northern end of the site, to minimise any potential intrusion into the setting of the Grade II* listed church and potentially harming its overall significance.
- 8.17 Any extension to this employment allocation, particularly to the north of the existing site towards Welby Lane should be resisted as this is likely to have an adverse impact on the setting of the Grade II* listed church, potentially harming its overall significance.

Recommendation

- 8.18 To fully comply with local and national and planning policies that seek to protect the setting of listed buildings, it is recommended that the criteria attached to Policy A26 be amended to advise that the scale, design and layout of any new development at the northern end of the proposed development site should have regard to the impact on the setting of the Grade II* listed St Bartholomew's Church.

POLICY A27: Holwell Business Park

Site Context

- 8.19 The Holwell Business Park site is located immediately to the north of Asfordby Hill, to the south of the Holwell Works, and the site is well contained by the neighbouring residential and industrial development, being generally bounded by Welby Road (from Asfordby Hill) to the east and the railway test track to the west.

Designated Heritage Assets

- 8.20 None of the listed buildings within Asfordby or the designated Asfordby Conservation Area lie within the vicinity of the allocated site, and the cluster of listed buildings at Welby Grange lie more than 1km to the north of this allocated site.

Potential Impact on Local Designated Heritage Assets

- 8.21 The allocation of the existing Holwell Business Park for future employment and residential purposes within its present boundaries will not affect the setting of any listed buildings within Asfordby Parish, given the relative distance between this site and any of these designated heritage assets and the intervening development.

Recommendation

- 8.22 No changes required to Policy A27.

9.0 SUMMARY

- 9.1 This assessment has considered the potential impact of the policies and site allocations in the APNP on the local historic environment.
- 9.2 The assessment has considered that the generic policies in the APNP are largely neutral in terms of the historic environment, but there are concerns that Policy A8 in respect of the local heritage assets is not consistent with the guidance in the NPPF and may therefore not be afforded any weight in the decision-taking process.

- 9.3 The assessment has also considered the impact of development on the allocated residential and employment sites within the APNP on the setting of the heritage assets within Asfordby Parish. It is generally concluded that the development of the sites as proposed within the APNP will not have any adverse impact on the setting or significance of any listed buildings in the Asfordby Parish and will not harm the character or appearance of the Asfordby Conservation Area, subject in some cases to further considerations relating to the design, layout and scale of the development.
- 9.4 In this context it is considered that the allocation of the residential and employment sites within the APNP is consistent with the objectives of the NPPF in respect of development within the historic environment.

STEPHEN BRADWELL, MA MRTPI IHBC
25 September 2016
